BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 04854 9612

REGULATORY AND ETHICAL ISSUES IN MEDICAL RESEARCH AND DRUG DEVELOPMENT

VOLUME I

PROFESSOR TRUDO LEMMENS

With the able assistance of Ikka Delamer and Vanessa Kee

FACULTY OF LAW

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FALL 2000

(for internal use by students)

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
AUG 17 2000
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

REGULATORY AND ETHICAL ISSUES IN MEDICAL RESEARCH AND DRUG DEVELOPMENT

VOLUME I

PROFESSOR TRUDO LEMMENS

With the able assistance of Ikka Delamer and Vanessa Kee

FACULTY OF LAW

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FALL 2000

(for internal use by students)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME I

I. Historical Overview: Unethical Research	**Page**
Beecher, H.K. "Ethics and Clinical Research" (1966) 274 *New England Journal of Medicine* 1354-1360.	**1**
Katz, Jay. *Experimentation with Human Beings* (New York: Russell Sage Foundation, 1972) 283-292.	**8**
"Opening Statement of the Prosecution, December 9, 1946" and "Judgement and Aftermath" in George J. Annas and Michael A. Grodin (eds.), *The Nazi Doctors and the Nuremberg Code: Human Rights in Human Experimentation* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1992) 67-104.	**18**
Excerpts of the Nuremberg Trial. From: Katz, Jay. *Experimentation with Human Beings* (New York: Russell Sage Foundation, 1972) 298-305.	**38**
Brandt, Allan. "Racism and Research: The Case of the Tuskegee Syphilis Study" (December 1978) *Hastings Center Report* 21-29.	**45**
Lemmens, Trudo. "In the Name of National Security Lessons from the Final Report on the Human Radiation Experiments." (1999) 6 *European Journal of Health Law* 7-23.	**54**
II. Philosophical Reflections on Medical Research	
Abraham, John, *Science, Politics and the Pharmaceutical Industry* (London, UCL Press, 1995), Chapter 1: "Bias in Science and Regulation" 1-35.	**63**
Calbresi, Guido, "Reflections on Medical Experimentation in Humans." (1969) 98 *Daedalus* 387-393.	**81**
Jonas, Hans, "Philosophical Reflections on Experimentation with Human Subjects" in Paul Freund (ed.) *Experimentation with Human Subjects* (New York: George Braziller, 1970) 1-31.	**91**
Meslin, E., et al. "Principlism and the ethical appraisal of clinical trials" (1995) 9(5) *Bioethics* 399-418.	**107**

III. Models of Research Regulation

Annas, George. "The Changing Landscape of Human Experimentation: Nuremberg, Helsinki, and Beyond." (1992) 2 *Health Matrix* 119-140. **118**

Verdun-Jones, Simon and David Weisstub. "The Regulation of Biomedical Research Experimentation in Canada: Developing an Effective Apparatus for the Implementation of Ethical Priciples in a Scientific Milieu." (1996-97) 27 *Ottawa Law Review* 297-341. **129**

Hirtle, M., Lemmens, T. and Sprumont D., "A Comparative Analysis of Research Ethics Review Mechanisms and the ICH Good Clinical Practice Guideline" (1999) 7 *European Journal of Health Law* 5-31. **151**

Weiner, Charles. "Is self regulation enough today?: Evaluating the Recombinant DNA Controversy" (1999) 9 *Health Matrix* 289-302. **166**

Shapiro, Harold T., "Stopping Science: Human Cloning – Should It Be Stopped?" (1999) 9 *Health Matrix* 303-309. **173**

IV. The Research Ethics Board (REB): Composition and Function in a Changing Environment; Conflict of Interest.

Edgar, Harold and David Rothman. "The Institutional Review Board and Beyond: Future Challenges to the Ethics of Human Experimentation." (1995) 73 The *Milbank Quarterly* 489-506. **177**

Glass, Kathleen C. and Trudo Lemmens. "Conflict of Interest and Commercialization of Biomedical Research: What is the Role of Research Ethics Review?" in Timothy Caulfield and Bryn Williams-Jones (eds) *The Commercialization of Genetic Research: Ethical, Lgal and Policy Issues* (New York: Plenum Press, 1999) 79-99. **187**

McNeill, Paul. "International Trends in Research Regulation: Science as Negotiation" in D.N. Weisstub (ed.) *Research on Human Subjects: Ethics, Law and Social Policy* (Kidlington: Pergamon, 1998) 234-263. **198**

Turcotte Maatz, Claire "Comment: University Physician-Researcher Conflicts of Interest: The Inadequacy of Current Controls and Proposed Reform" (1992) 7 *High Technology Law Journal* 137-188. **209**

Eichenwald, Kurt and Gina Kolata, "Drug Trials Hide Conflicts for Doctors" *New York Times*. May 16, 1999. **236**

Phillips, Robert A. and John Hoey, "Constraints of Interest: Lessons at the Hospital for Sick Children" (1998) 159 *Canadian Medical Association Journal* 955-957. **250**

VOLUME II

V. The Content of REB Review; Risk Assessment; Value and Validity; Monitoring Research

Freedman, Benjamin et al., "Demarcating Research and Treatment: A Systematic Approach for the Analysis of the Ethics of Clinical Research" (1992) 40 *Clinical Research* 653-660. **253**

Kopelman, L., "Estimating Risk in Human Research" (1981) 29 *Clinical Research* 1-8. **261**

Freedman, Benjamin. "Scientific Value and Validity as Ethical Requirements for Research: A Proposed Explication" (1987) 9(6) *IRB: A Review of Human Subjects Research* 7-10. **269**

Weijer, C., et al., "Monitoring Clinical Research: An Obligation Unfulfilled" (1995) 152 *Canadian Medical Association Journal* 1973-1980. **273**

Heath, Erica. "The IRB's Monitoring Function: Four Concepts of Monitoring" (1979) 1(5) *IRB: A Review of Human Subjects Research* 1-12. **281**

Emanuel, Ezekiel J., *et al.*, "What makes clinical research ethical?" (2000) 283(20) *Journal of the American Medical Association (JAMA)* 2701-2711 **285**

VI. The Ethics of Clinical Trial Design

Freedman, Benjamin. "Equipoise and the Ethics of Clinical Research." (1987) 317 *New England Journal of Medicine* 141-145. **296**

Hellman, Samuel and Deborah S. Hellman, "Of Mice but not Men: Problems of the Randomized Clinical Trial" (1991) 324 *New England Journal of Medicine* 1585-1589. **301**

Passamini, Eugene, "Clinical Trials – Are They Ethical?" (1991) 324 *New England Journal of Medicine* 1589-1592. **305**

Freedman, Benjamin *et al.*, "Placebo Orthodoxy in Clinical Research I: Empirical and Methodological Myths" and "Placebo Orthodoxy in Clinical Research II: Ethical and Legal and Regulatory Myths" (1996) 24(3) *Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics* 243-259. **308**

VII. Informed Consent and Challenges to Informed Consent

Donagan, Alan, "Informed Consent in Therapy and Experimentation." (1977) 2 *Journal of Medicine and Philosophy* 307-329. **325**

Addicott, Christian D., "Regulating Research on the Terminally Ill: A Proposal for Heightened Safeguards" (1999) 15 *Journal of Contemporary Health Law and Policy* 479-524. **337**

Dickert, Neal and Grady, Christine, "What's the Price of a Research Subject? Approaches to Payment for Research Participation." (1999) 34 *New England Journal of Medicine* 198-203. **361**

Lemmens, Trudo and Elliot, Carl, "Guinea Pigs on the Payroll: The Ethics of Paying Research Subjects." (1999) 7 *Accountability in Research* 3-20. **366**

Moreno, John. "Captive and Convenient Populations" in Jeffrey Kahn et al. (eds) *Beyond Consent* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1998) 111-130. **376**

Freedman, Benjamin *et al.*, "In Loco Parentis: Minimal Risk as an Ethical Threshold for Research upon Children." (March-April 1993) *Hastings Center Report* 13-19. **387**

Elliot, Carl, "Caring About Risks" (1997) 54 *Archives of General Psychiatry* 113-116. **394**

Weiss Roberts, Laura, "The Ethical Basis of Psychiatric Research: Conceptual Issues and Empirical Findings" (1998) 39 *Comprehensive Psychiatry* 99-110. **398**

VIII. Selection of Subjects and Justice; Research Involving Communities

Dresser, Rebecca, "Wanted: Single, White Male for Medical Research" (January-February 1992) *Hastings Center Report* 24-29. **410**

Charo, R.A., "Protecting Us to Death: Women, Pregnancy, and Clinical Research Trials" (1993) 38(1) *Saint Louis University Law Journal* 135-187. **416**

Weijer, Charles, "Evolving Ethical Issues in Selection of Subjects for Clinical Research" (1996) 5 *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* 334-45. **443**

Weijer, Charles, *et al.*, "Protecting Communities in Research: Current Guidelines and Limits of Extrapolation" (1999) 23(3) *Nature Genetics* 275-80. **445**

VOLUME III

IX. Genetics and Research

American Society of Human Genetics. "ASHG Report. Statement of Informed Consent for Genetic Research" (1995) 59 *American Journal of Human Genetics* 471-474. **461**

Glass, Kathleen C. et al., "Structuring the Review of Human Genetics Protocols Part I: Gene Localization and Identification Studies" (July-August 1996) 18(4) *IRB: A Review of Human Subjects Research* 1-9. **465**

Glass, Kathleen C. et al., "Structuring the Review of Human Genetics Protocols Part II: Diagnostic and Screening Studies" (May-August 1997) 19(3,4) *IRB: A Review of Human Subjects Research* 1-13. **474**

Glass, Kathleen C. et al., "Structuring the Review of Human Genetics Protocols Part III: Gene Therapy Studies" (March-April 1999) 21 *IRB: A Review of Human Subjects Research* 1-9. **486**

Knoppers, Bartha Maria and Laberge, Claude, "DNA Banking / Collecting: A Canadian "Sample" of Consent Forms" in Bartha Maria Knoppers *et al.* (eds) *Legal Rights and Human Genetic Material* (Toronto: Edmond Montgomery Publications, 1996) 33-49. **495**

Merz, J., "Is Genetics Research Minimal Risk?" (1996) 18(6) *IRB: A Review of Human Subjects Research* 7-8. **504**

X. Justice and International Research

Annas, George and Grodin, Michael, "Research Forum: Ethics and Studies of HIV; Human Rights and Maternal-Fetal HIV Transmission Prevention Trials in Africa" (1998) 88(4) *American Journal of Public Health* 560-563. **506**

Christakis, Nicholas and Panner, Morris J., "Existing International Ethical Guidelines for Human Subjects Research: Some Open Questions." (1991) 19 *Law, Medicine, & Health Care* 214-221. **510**

Crouch, Robert A., and Arras, John D., "AZT Trials and Tribulations" (November-December 1998) *Hastings Center Report* 26-34. **518**

Levine, Carol, "Placebos and HIV: Lessons Learned" (November-December 1998) *Hastings Center Report* 43-48. **526**

XI. Legal Liability

Sava, Helen *et al.,* "Legal Liability of Physicians in Medical Research" (1994) 17 *Clinical Investigative Medicine* 148-184. **532**

Freedman, Benjamin and Cranley Glass, Kathleen, "*Weiss v. Solomon*: A Case Study in Institutional Responsibility for Clinical Research" (1990) *18 Law, Medicine & Health Care* 395-403. **569**

Harvey, Ian and Chadwick, Ruth, "Compensation for Harm: the Implications for Medical Research" (1992) 34 *Social Sciences and Medicine* 1399-1404. **578**

Mariner, Wendy K., "Compensation for Research Injuries" in Anna C. Mastroianni *et al.*, (eds) *Women and Health Research: Ethical and Legal Issues of Including Women in Clinical Studies (Volume 2)* (Washington: National Academy Press, 1994) 113-126. **584**

XII. The Drug Approval System

Lexchin, Joel, "Who Needs Faster Drug Approval Times in Canada: The Public or the Industry?" (1994) 24(2) *International Journal of Health Services* 253-264. **592**

Lexchin, Joel, "Drug Makers and Drug Regulators: Too Close for Comfort. A Study of the Canadian Situation" (1990) 31 *Social Sciences and Medicine* 1257-1263. **597**

Edgar, Harold and Rothman, David J., "New Rules for New Drugs: the Challenge of AIDS to the Regulatory Process" (1990) 68 *Milbank Quarterly* 111-142. **604**

XIII. Cases

Burton v. *Brooklyn Doctors Hosp*. 452 N.Y.S. 2d 875 (App. Div. 1982). **621**

Halikas v. *University of Minnesota* 856 F.Supp. 1331 (D.Minn 1994). **626**

Halushka v. University of Saskatchewan et al. (1965) 52 W.W.R. 608. **630**

Kus v. *Sherman Hosp*. 664 N.E. 2d (Ill.App.2Dist. 1995) **636**

Moore v. *Regents of the University of California* 793 P.2d 479 (Cal. 1990) **641**

Zimmer v. Ringrose (1981) 4 W.W.R. 75. **664**

Bailey v. *Lally* 481 F.Supp. 203 (1979) **671**

Stewart v. *Cleveland Clinic Foundation* 1999 WL 1068225 (Ohio App.8 Dist.) **685**